

City Council

Monday 14 June 2021

PRESENT:

Councillor Mrs Beer, in the Chair.

Councillor Mrs Bridgeman, Vice Chair.

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bingley, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Dr Buchan, Burden, Carlyle, Churchill, Coker, Collins, Corvid, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Deacon, Derrick, Downie, Drear, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Hulme, James, Mrs Johnson, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, Murphy, Neil, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Singh, R Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Vincent, Wakeham, Ms Watkin and Wheeler.

Apologies for absence: Councillors Lowry, McDonald, Morris and Tuffin

The meeting started at 2.00 pm and finished at 6.35 pm.

Note: The full discussion can be viewed on the webcast of the City Council meeting at www.plymouth.gov.uk. At a future meeting, the Council will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

1. Minutes

The minutes of the meeting held on 21 May 2021 were agreed as a true and accurate record.

2. Declarations of Interest

The following declarations of interest were made by councillors in accordance with the code of conduct in respect of items under consideration at the meeting -

| Name | Minute Number | Reason | Interest |
|-----------------------------|---------------|----------|----------|
| Councillor Glenn Jordan | 9B | | Personal |
| Councillor Shannon Burden | 9B | | Personal |
| Councillor Jemima Laing | 9B | Governor | Personal |
| Councillor Andrea Johnson | 9B | Governor | Personal |
| Councillor Sue Dann | 9B | Governor | Personal |
| Councillor Rebecca Smith | 9B | | Personal |
| Councillor Nigel Churchill | 9B | Governor | Personal |
| Councillor Nick Kelly | 9B | Governor | Personal |
| Councillor Natalie Harrison | 9B | | Personal |

3. Appointments to Committees, Outside Bodies etc

Members noted the changes to political proportionality of the Council, Council membership and outside bodies.

4. **Announcements**

The Lord Mayor thanked South West Water for their substantial donations to Bowel Cancer South West and the NSPCC.

The Lord Mayor recognised:

- David Draffan, Service Director for Economic development for being awarded an MBE for services to local government.
- Professor Ray Jones, Professor of Health Informatics at the University of Plymouth had been awarded an MBE for services to digital health and social care.
- Alison Pessell, Company Secretary for Fish Markets had been awarded the MBE for services to the English fishing industry.
- Chris Robinson had been awarded the MBE for services to heritage, conservation, education, business and tourism in Plymouth.
- Mr Paul Morriss, Detachment Commander for Devon Army Cadet Force had been awarded the BEM for voluntary service to young people in Plymouth.

The Lord Mayor proposed to suspend the rules of procedure to allow the Director of Public Health Ruth Harrell to provide an update on COVID-19 to Council and answer any questions that were submitted by Councillors to Ruth.

Deputy Lord Mayor, Councillor Mrs Bridgeman seconded the proposal and went to a vote.

Members voted unanimously in favour of the motion.

Ruth Harrell, Director of Public Health presented a video to Council.

5. **Questions by the Public**

There were two questions submitted by members of the public.

The following question was submitted by Mr Alan Ramage and answered by Councillor Kelly (Leader of the Council).

Question: "Investing to Save the Planet" by Alice Ross of the Financial Times explains how investing in "best in class" companies transitioning to a low carbon future and researching into low carbon solutions enables our money to make a difference. Will PCC ask its pensions fund managers to do this?

Answer: Plymouth City Council is a member of the Devon Pension Fund. This is not the Plymouth City Council pension fund and as such Plymouth City Council are reliant upon Devon County Council to set their strategic decisions as we have no direct control over the fund or its administration. However, the Devon Pension Fund (DPF) has pledged its portfolio of investments will be net zero by 2050 at the latest. The funds investments in companies classed as carbon intensive have fallen significantly over the last few years. When last measured in December 2019 it showed a 21.5% reduction when compared

| | |
|--|---|
| | <p>to 9 months previously. In the short term the fund has committed to invest £200 million into renewable energy infrastructure funds by the Brunel pension partnership. The DPF work with the Brunel Pension partnership will decarbonise all its current investments at a rate of 7% a year and to increase investments into carbon solutions. The DPF committed to not only reducing the carbon footprint of current investments but to ensure that in the long term investments are carbon neutral.</p> |
|--|---|

The following question was submitted by Mrs Sonia Hosking and answered by Councillor Riley (Cabinet Member for Governance, HR, IT and Community Safety).

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>Question: In light of the growing antisocial behaviour in Southway and particularly the recent constant vandalism to the fence on bond Street field, do the council have any intention or budget for considering CCTV for the safety and well-being of the residents and be a deterrent for the offenders?</p> | <p>Answer: Plymouth City Council remains committed to addressing matters relating to anti-social or criminal behaviour to minimise the impact this has on communities and victims.</p> <p>Since being made aware of the emerging issues in Southway, Plymouth City Council have been working in partnership with Devon and Cornwall Police to develop an intelligence picture in the area to consider the tactical deployment of resources. Reviewing information, we are currently not able to substantiate the deployment of a rapid CCTV solutions, however this information will continue to be reviewed by the multi-agency arrangements set up.</p> <p>The partnership approach has resulted in the implementation of a localised problem-solving plan with the Community Connections Community Youth Pop Up team, carrying out 'feet on the street' patrols, engaging with those identified in order to direct them into alternative activities and offer support where required. Further to this the local policing team will be carrying out increased patrols throughout the area to develop intelligence, provide immediate interventions where required, engage with those concerned and offer reassurance to local residents.</p> <p>Information collected during this response will be shared and reviewed by Plymouth</p> |
|---|--|

| | |
|--|--|
| | <p>City Council's Community Safety Team, and the Child Centred Policing team, both of whom specialise in interventions to limit risk. They also provide support and instigate enforcement activity where necessary and proportionate. As information is developed, further consideration to the deployment of rapid CCTV solutions will be given.</p> <p>As part of the Council's long-term approach, services are working together and with key partners for the planning, scope and design of CCTV solutions within the city. This work seeks to optimise coverage within the city and ensure that known trouble spots have sufficient coverage. This will include updating some of the current analogue cameras to digital cameras and filling identified gaps with rapid deployment options.</p> |
|--|--|

6. **Capital and Revenue Outturn Report 2020 - 21**

Councillor Nick Kelly, Leader of the Council, introduced the provisional Capital and Revenue report for the financial year 2020/21 report this was seconded by Councillor Evans OBE (Leader of the opposition).

Councillor Evans OBE (Leader of the opposition) and Councillor Kelly (Leader of the Council) gave speeches on their perspectives regarding the report.

Following debate, with contributions from Councillors Dann and Nicholson Council agreed to:-

1. Note the provisional revenue outturn position as at 31 March 2021
2. Note the Capital Outturn Report including the Capital Financing Requirement of £105.741m.
3. Reverse the September 2020 Cabinet decision to approve the creation of a Covid Reserve to fund the additional costs and lost income arising from the Pandemic.
4. Approve the carry forward of COVID-19 grants received in advance for draw down in 2021/22 in line with Government guidelines
5. Approve the carry forward of a contingency sum of £3.526m.

7. **Corporate Plan 2021 - 25**

Councillor Kelly, Leader of the Council introduced the motion on the Corporate Plan for 2021-2025.

The revised Corporate Plan 2021-2025 aimed to reflect the new Administration's vision for the city and the Council, and to reframe the Council's mission, values and priorities to support this.

In addition, following fifteen months of unprecedented challenges created both nationally and locally by the COVID-19 pandemic there had been an opportunity to reintegrate response and recovery activities into the Corporate Plan and the Council's associated delivery plans. The report described the revisions that have been made to the Corporate Plan, and asked the Council to adopt it.

Following debate, with contributions from Councillors Dr Buchan, Dann, Evans OBE, Nicholson, Wheeler, Mrs Aspinall and Kelly.

Council agreed to:

- Adopt the Corporate Plan 2021-25 at Appendix B of the report

Votes For: (27) Councillors Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Burden, Carlyle, Collins, Deacon, Downie, Drean, Harrison, Hulme, James, Mrs Johnson, Jordan, Kelly, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith, Stoneman, Wakeham and Singh.

Votes Against: (0)

Abstentions: (24) Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Dr Buchan, Churchill, Coker, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Evans OBE, Haydon, Goslin, Hendy, Laing, Murphy, Penberthy, Rennie, Stevens, Vincent, Mrs Watkin, Wheeler and Neil.

Did not vote/absent: (6) Councillors Mrs Beer (Lord Mayor), Dr Cree, Lowry, McDonald, Morris, Tuffin,

The motion was carried.

9. **NHS Dental Waiting Lists**

Councillor Mrs Aspinall introduced the motion on NHS Dental Waiting Lists. This was seconded by Councillor Laing.

After a debate this motion was passed.

Votes for: (45) Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Dr Buchan, Coker, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Haydon, Goslin, Hendy, Laing, Murphy, Penberthy, Rennie, Stevens, Vincent, Churchill, Wheeler, Neil, Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Burden, Carlyle, Collins, Deacon, Downie, Drean, Harrison, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Loveridge, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Smith, Stoneman, Wakeham, Singh.

Votes Against: (0)

Abstentions: (0)

Absent/Did not vote: (11) Councillors Mrs Bowyer, Bowyer, Ms Watkin, Dr Mahony, Mrs Johnson, Tuffin, Morris, McDonald, Lowry, Dr Cree and Mrs Beer.

10. **Education Recovery Plan**

Councillor Cresswell prozed this Motion on Notice for the Education Recovery Plan which had been seconded by Councillor Allen.

Councillor Cresswell presented the motion on notice to council which requested Council to:

Following a debate the motion was carried.

Votes for: (49) Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Dr Buchan, Coker, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Derrick, Evans OBE, Haydon, Goslin, Hendy, Laing, Murphy, Penberthy, Rennie, Stevens, Vincent, Churchill, Mrs Johnson, Wheeler, Neil, Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Burden, Carlyle, Collins, Deacon, Downie, Drean, Harrison, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Loveridge, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Riley Salmon, Shayer, Smith, Stoneman, Wakeham, Singh, Mrs Bowyer, and Bowyer.

Votes Against: (0)

Abstentions: (0)

Absent/Did not vote: (8) Councillors Mrs Beer, Dr Cree, Lowry, McDonald, Morris, Tuffin, Mrs Watkin and Dr Mahony.

11. **Mental Health Services**

Councillor Mrs Aspinall introduced the motion on Mental Health Services. This was seconded by Councillor Haydon.

Following a debate the motion was carried.

Votes for (46):

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Dr Buchan, Burden, Carlyle, Collins, Churchill, Coker, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Deacon, Derrick, Downie, Drean, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Murphy, Neil, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Singh, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Vincent, Wakeham and Wheeler.

Votes Against (0):

Abstentions: (0)

Did not vote/Absent (11):

Councillors Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Dr Cree, Johnson, Lowry, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Morris, Tuffin and Ms Watkin.

12. **Opting Out of NHS Patient Data sharing with the Private Sector**

Councillor Evans OBE introduced the motion on Opting Out of NHS Patient Data sharing with the Private Sector and moved an amendment to include a date change. This was seconded by Councillor Corvid.

Following a debate the motion was carried.

Votes for (46):

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Bingley, Mrs Bridgeman, Dr Buchan, Burden, Carlyle, Collins, Churchill, Coker, Corvid, Cresswell, Dann, Deacon, Derrick, Downie, Drean, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Hulme, James, Jordan, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Murphy, Neil, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Singh, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Vincent, Wakeham and Wheeler.

Votes Against (0):

Abstentions: (0)

Did not vote/Absent (11):

Councillors Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Dr Cree, Johnson, Lowry, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Morris, Tuffin and Ms Watkin.

13. **Urgent Key Decisions to be Reported**

Councillor Nicholson (Deputy Leader) gave a brief update on an urgent key decisions taken since the last meeting. The update was seconded by Councillor Evans OBE.

- Development of a Plymouth Short Term Care Centre

Council noted the urgent key decision taken by Councillor Evans OBE, and published on the 15 March 2021.

14. **Questions by Councillors**

| | From | To | Subject |
|---|--|--------------------------|--|
| I | Councillor Dann | Councillor Mrs Bridgeman | A commitment to reopen the airport and PCC leading on the climate change? Councillor Nicholson reported that Councillor Mrs Bridgeman not responsible for the airport. |
| | Response: There are clean green technologies in aviation now as well as drone technology. | | |
| | Supplementary Question: The conservatives closed the airport. There is a need to drastically reduce carbon in the city. How do persuade cabinet colleagues to re-open airport? | | |
| | Response: All discussed within the manifesto regardless of history. | | |

| | | | |
|---|---|--------------------------|---|
| 2 | Councillor Stevens | Councillor Mrs Pengelly | Lat52 flats and the safety of the building, emergency work and the concern for residents. Can you assure that local councillors are briefed in good time and in a language we can understand? |
| | Response: Apologies that you have not received the information and I will ensure that this is addressed. | | |
| | Supplementary question: A briefing scheduled later this month and residents need the information now and not in a couple of weeks. | | |
| | Response: Will get back to you as quickly as possible. | | |
| 3 | Councillor Churchill | Councillor Mrs Bridgeman | South Hams undertaking the bin collection at Sherford and PCC taxpayers are being refused bin collections from South Hams and PCC – what is going on? |
| | Response: Please forward this as case work and this is not acceptable. | | |
| 4 | Councillor Hulme | Councillor Mrs Bridgeman | Timeframe for when Weston Mill tip to be open 7 days? |
| | Response: Waiting for staff to comeback and priority has been grass cutting. | | |
| 5 | Councillor Singh | Councillor Mrs Bridgeman | The renaming of Sir John Hawkins Square and the road sign not been replaced. If there was an emergency tomorrow who would be responsible? |
| | Response: Forward this question to me and I will address this. | | |
| | Supplementary question: Road name missing and no name attached if someone dying on a road who would be accountable? | | |
| | Response: I do not have a response at this time. | | |
| 6 | Councillor Haydon | Councillor Deacon | Update on how many people we have helped so far on the EU settlement scheme. This scheme ends on 30 June? |
| | Response: Will have to get back to you with a response. | | |
| | Supplementary question: Could he please explain to these citizens where they need to go for help? But understand that Councillor Deacon is new in post. | | |
| 7 | Councillor Dr Buchan | Councillor Mrs Bridgeman | When would the schedule be published regarding the neighbourhood sweep? |
| | Response: They were still working on the schedules for back lane cleaning and will answer this in an email. | | |
| | Supplementary question: Can you clarify in Honicknowle Ward actions have not been seen and timescale that residents and councillors to check? | | |
| | Response: They are looking to update the website and to make more user friendly. | | |
| 8 | Councillor Dann | Councillor Mrs Bridgeman | Grass maintenance digital map, grass to cut and where to be cut taken to scrutiny in March. |

| | | | |
|----|--|--------------------------|---|
| | | | Were you aware this was publicly available? |
| | Response: When I first undertook this role I checked the website, there was no clear detail and this will be addressed and website updated and the information available to residents. | | |
| | Supplementary question: On 24 March any resident could access the information and would also like to ask engagement sent to all councillors for their comments and as we were in full lockdown – how on earth engage with every resident when in full lockdown. What other engagement could have been possibly been carried out? | | |
| | Response: Some consultation better than no consultation for e.g. tree planting happened in in my ward and I wasn't consulted on. | | |
| 9 | Councillor Stevens | Councillor Mrs Pengelly | Controversial planning application at Hamoaze House. The Planning Department are investigating a breach of planning conditions. Will she be as frustrated as me because the applicant is PCC and the agent is a member of staff? PCC not following planning conditions? |
| | Response: Councillor Stevens wants me to respond to a planning application that I am not aware of. Yes I do follow your frustrations. | | |
| | Supplementary question: Can you please liaise with the community connections officer to ensure any breach is stopped and planning applications can proceed in the usual way that we would all expect. | | |
| | Response: Yes | | |
| 10 | Councillor Coker | Councillor Dreaan | The long awaited Better Bus Strategy announced just before the election can you confirm that PCC has agreed with the Department of Transport to receive £100k to set up before the 1 Oct Bus Quality Partnership? |
| | Response: Yes I can I will also will be talking to the bus and coach industry important to hear their views and as soon as I have more information will share. | | |
| | Supplementary question: Infrastructure interventions and to encourage more people to use public transport please explain how a manifesto reducing free car parking charges in the city centre sits with that agenda. | | |
| | Response: This is being looked at by the team and we are looking at all options. | | |
| 11 | Councillor Neil | Councillor Mrs Bridgeman | Manifesto pledges including the scrapping the bin delivery charges, scrapping the charges for rubble etc and extending garden waste collections to November. Can you reassure me that in delivering that there would be no detriment to the staff concerned in terms of |

| | | | |
|----|---|--------------------------|---|
| | | | retention and pay. |
| | Response: Councillor Mrs Bridgeman thanked Councillor Neil for his question but deferred it to Councillor Kelly to respond: Cost implication and efficiencies to be made up within the service, we pay huge amounts of money to clear our streets of fly tipping. These decision have been thought through and the benefits for us as a city to be clean and tidy and to allow residents to manage their waste in a responsible manner without being penalised. There are no plans to reduce manpower at Chelson Meadow but pay bandings would be addressed because part of the role that was undertaken no longer takes place. | | |
| | Supplementary question: Charges now been scrapped do you think it is ok for somebody living in rented flat who no access to garden to be paying a contribution to landscaping project or doing their kitchen up? | | |
| | Response: There are services I don't use and certain services I do use. We all pay our council tax to access services and council tax paid by all covers a multitude of services which are used by some. Having a city that is a clean place to visit is a benefit. | | |
| 12 | Councillor Singh | Councillor Mrs Bridgeman | Credit to you 9 days into the job asking you have a look at the Legacy Labour left behind in Drake Ward – what reassurance can you give me to clear up the mess that Plymouth Labour left behind? |
| | Response: Thank you for acknowledging the fact that I walked the ward with you. The first thing I notice the lack of recycling bins and never seen so much, fly tipping, weeds and was already on the case and will happily visit the area again. Councillor Rennie objected to the comments made by Councillor Mrs Bridgeman. Councillor Mrs Bridgeman apologised to Councillor Rennie and but was saying what she had seen. | | |
| | Supplementary question: The truth is hurtful and offensive because it is what it is and you speak as you see. Some of the residents have asked to have CCRTV in the Drake Ward for the high refuse areas. | | |
| | Response: That is not within my portfolio but will investigate that in the future. Councillor Riley should be able to answer that question. | | |
| 13 | Councillor Stevens | Councillor Smith | The opposition lead should be briefed on the planning committee agenda once it made public. Agenda has been published today and I have not been briefed. Can Councillor Smith distinguished the cross party working that I have established and ensure that not only the ruling party is briefed? |
| | Response: I will explore this with the team and will come back to you. I didn't realise that this happened before. | | |
| | Supplementary question: It wasn't a criticism of the new Chair but I am happy to accept her answer today and will hold her to account if this not taken further. | | |
| 14 | Councillor Loveridge | Councillor Dreaan | During the months of August |

| | | | |
|----|---|------------------|--|
| | | | and September the Ridgeway was hit badly by flooding. Can you provide an update on how to prevent the flooding from happening again? |
| | Response: The team were looking at two options. The main problem that the water was flowing down the pavement and collecting at the bottom resulting in running into the shop. Once I have further information this will be shared with you. | | |
| 15 | Councillor Dr Buchan | Councillor Kelly | His use of the word manpower in his recent comment was appropriate and his commitment to equalities? |
| | Response: I guess in life we use common phrases all the time and I used that term but not in a derogatory way. Moving forward will be more conscious of the words that I use. We have set up a working group and equally Alderman which you haven't raise and but I have raise that we should use the term Alderwoman. We are navigating all the time and do not want my words to be misconstrued. In terms of the English language it gets very difficult and I apologise if this brought offence and I am very much about equality and diversity. | | |

Please note that questions, answers, supplementary questions and supplementary answers have been summarised.